DIVORCE, SEPARATION AND THE DISTRIBUTION OF PROPERTY
DIVORCE, SEPARATION AND THE DISTRIBUTION OF PROPERTY

J. Thomas Oldham
John H. Freeman Professor of Law University of Houston School of Law Member of the California, Texas and District of Columbia Bars

2021
(DATE ORIGINALLY PUBLISHED: 1987)
Dedication

To my family
Table of Contents

Acknowledgments

Chapter 1  DISPUTES BETWEEN UNMARRIED PEOPLE  
§ 1.01  Introduction  
§ 1.02  Disputes Between Cohabitants  
  [1]  The Traditional View  
  [2]  Severability  
  [3]  Selective Illegality  
  [6]  Theories of Recovery in Cohabitants’ Disputes  
    [a]  Express Contract  
    [b]  Implied Contract  
    [c]  Resulting Trust  
    [d]  Constructive Trust  
    [e]  Express Trust  
    [f]  Implied or Express Partnership  
    [g]  Equitable Lien  
    [h]  Loan  
    [i]  Unjust Enrichment  
    [j]  Intentional Interference with Expectation of Inheritance  
    [k]  Joint Venture  
    [l]  Other Equitable Remedies  
    [m]  Accounting  
    [n]  Summary  
[7]  De Facto Marriage  
[8]  Consideration by a Divorce Court of Property Accumulated During Premarital Cohabitation  
[10]  Cohabitants Treated as Spouses in Certain Instances  
[12]  Other Public Policy Issues  
[13]  Choice of Law  
[14]  Other Matters
### § 1.03 Dating Claims
- [1] In General 25

### § 1.04 Tort Actions Between the Parties 28

### § 1.05 Actions Between Persons Who Were Engaged to Be Married 32
- [1] Breach of Promise of Marriage 32

## Chapter 2 REQUIREMENTS OF A VALID MARRIAGE 43

### § 2.01 Introduction 44
### § 2.02 Marriage Restrictions 44
- [1] Monogamy 44
- [2] Kinship 44
- [3] Age 45
  - [a] Mental Illness 45
  - [b] Drugs and Alcohol 46
- [5] Duress 46
- [6] Fraud 46
- [7] Marriage in Jest 47
- [8] Impotence 47
- [9] The Distinction Between a Void and a Voidable Marriage 47

### § 2.03 Establishing a Valid Marriage 49
- [1] Ceremonial Marriage 49
  - [a] License 49
  - [b] Ceremony 50
  - [c] Consummation 50
  - [d] Choice of Law 50
  - [a] Agreement to Be Married 52
  - [b] Living Together 52
    - [i] Cohabitation 52
    - [ii] Duration of Cohabitation 53
  - [c] Holding Out as Husband and Wife 53
  - [d] Choice of Law 53
  - [e] The Creation of a Common Law Marriage After the Removal of a Marriage Impediment 54
  - [f] The Immediacy Requirement 55
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[3] Proxy Marriage 55
  [a] Description 55
  [b] Effects of a Putative Marriage 57

Chapter 3  RULES GOVERNING PROPERTY DIVISION
AT DIVORCE: A GENERAL SURVEY 59

§ 3.01 Introduction 59
§ 3.02 The Title System 60
  [1] In General 60
  [2] Dissatisfaction with the Title System 60
    [a] Policy Consequences 60
    [b] Fairness Concerns 61
    [c] Dissatisfaction with Alimony 61
    [d] Change in the Nature of Marriage 62
§ 3.03 Equitable Distribution Systems 63
  [1] In General 63
  [6] Importance of Characterization of Property 73

Chapter 4  MARITAL AGREEMENTS 75

§ 4.01 Introduction 77
§ 4.02 The Traditional Rule of Nonenforceability 77
§ 4.03 Modern Enforceability: Generally Accepted Equitable Limits 82
  [1] Written Agreement 83
  [2] Fraud 84
  [4] Voluntary Execution 96
  [5] Independent Counsel 110
  [6] Agreement Cannot Encourage Divorce 113
  [7] Consideration 118
  [10] Reading and Understanding the Agreement 120
[12] Modifying the Contract 120
[13] The Contract Must Clearly Apply to Divorce 121
§ 4.03A Points of Disagreement and Other Concerns 121
[1] Contracts Limiting Alimony 122
[2] Unfair Property Division Contracts 126
   [a] In General 126
   [b] Change in Circumstances 137
[4] Effectiveness of Waivers in Marriage Contracts Regarding Subsequently Enacted Equitable Distribution Statutes 141
§ 4.04 Spouse Buying 141
§ 4.05 Formal Requirements Applicable in Some States 142
   [1] Recordation or Acknowledgment 142
   [2] Witnesses 143
§ 4.06 Distinguishing Between Premarital, Post-Marital and Reconciliation Agreements 143
   [1] Post-Marital Agreements 143
   [2] Reconciliation Agreements 152
§ 4.07 Amendment or Revocation of a Marital Agreement 154
§ 4.08 Conflict of Laws and the Validity of a Marriage Contract 155
   [1] Agreements Signed in the U.S. 155
   [2] Agreements Signed Outside the U.S. 158
§ 4.09 Severability 161
§ 4.10 Contractual Provisions Regarding Matters Other Than Property or Support 162
§ 4.11 Provisions Regarding Child Custody and Child Support 164
§ 4.12 Limitation of Actions and Laches 165
§ 4.13 Promises to Convey Property During Marriage 166
§ 4.14 Miscellaneous Marriage Contract Issues 167
   [1] Contingent Marital Rights 167
   [2] Agreements Regarding Attorneys’ Fees in Divorce 168
   [6] Limiting Divorce Grounds 173
   [8] Relevance of Misrepresentations 174
   [9] Determining Whether a Claim Was Waived in or Rights to Property at Divorce Were Affected by the Agreement 175
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

10. Continuing Vitality of Common Law Defenses after the Adoption of the UPAA 175
11. Material Breach 176
12. Waiver, Rescission and Abandonment 176
13. Waivers of Interim Support 177
14. Estoppel and Ratification 178
15. Agreements Regarding Living Expenses During Marriage 179
16. Litigating in Federal Court 179
17. Retroactive Application of the Uniform Premarital Agreement Act 179
18. Ambiguous Provisions 180
19. Provisions Granting a Spouse Rights Based on the Duration of the Marriage 180
20. Impact of an Immigration Affidavit 181
21. Premarital Agreement Signed By a Minor 181
22. Validating a Premarital Agreement Via a Declaratory Judgment During Marriage 182
23. Fraudulent Inducement 182
24. No-Contest Clauses 182
25. Requiring a Party to Maintain a Life Insurance Policy after Divorce 182

### Chapter 5 WHAT CONSTITUTES “PROPERTY” AND “MARITAL PROPERTY” THAT IS DIVISIBLE AT DIVORCE? 183

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.01</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.02</td>
<td>Determining What Is “Property”</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>In General</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Narrow Definition of Property</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Broader Definition of Property</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Comment Regarding the Expansion of the Scope of Property</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.03</td>
<td>Determining What Is “Marital Property”</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>The Implied Exclusion Approach</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>The Onerous Acquisition Test</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>TYPES OF PROPERTY THAT FREQUENTLY ARE DESIGNATED SEPARATE PROPERTY BY STATUTE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.01</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.02</td>
<td>Property Acquired by Gift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Nature of a Gift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Interspousal Gifts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[a] Gifts from One Spouse to the Other Spouse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[b] Gifts from One Spouse to the Marital Estate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.03</td>
<td>Inherited Property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Importance of Statutory Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.04</td>
<td>Appreciation of Separate Property During Marriage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>In General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>States with Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>States Without Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Rents and Profits from Separate Property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.05</td>
<td>Rents and Profits from Separate Property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>In General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>States With Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>States Without Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Community Property States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.06</td>
<td>Mutations of Separate Property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>In General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>States with Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>States Without Express Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.07</td>
<td>Property Acquired Before Marriage and After Divorce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Premarital Acquisitions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Acquisitions After Divorce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.08</td>
<td>Property Acquired During Separation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Chapter 7  PROPERTY ACQUIRED OR IMPROVED WITH BOTH SEPARATE AND MARITAL PROPERTY

§ 7.01  Property Acquired with Contemporaneous Separate and Marital Property Consideration  

1. Introduction  
2. The Pro Rata Approach Applied in Community Property States  
3. The Unitary Property Approach  
4. Purchases in Common Law States  

§ 7.02  Different Approaches to Characterizing Property Acquired Over Time  

1. Introduction  
2. The Inception of Title Approach  
3. The Time of Vesting Approach  
4. The Pro Rata Approach  
5. The Presumption of a Gift  
6. Distinctions Based upon the Type of Property Involved  
7. Residences Purchased before Marriage and Transmutation  

§ 7.03  Characterizing Installment Purchases  

1. Definition  
2. Inception of Title Approach  
3. Time of Vesting Approach  
4. Pro Rata Approach  

§ 7.04  Characterizing Improvements  

1. Definition  
2. Characterization of Improvements  
   a. Majority Rule—Funds Contributed Toward Improvements Are a Loan  
   b. Minority View—Funds Contributed Toward Improvements Do Affect Ownership  
   c. Other Approaches  
   d. The Effect of Title  

§ 7.05  Using Marital Funds to Pay a Premarital Mortgage or Using Separate Funds to Pay a Mortgage Loan Obtained During Marriage  

1. Definition of a Credit Purchase  
2. Characterizing the Loan Proceeds  
   a. In General  
   b. The Primary Intention of the Lender Test  
   c. The Collection Rights of the Lender Test  
   d. The Nature of Security Provided Test
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[e] The Use of Proceeds Test</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f] The Source of Repayment Test</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[g] The Effect of a Prenuptial Agreement</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[h] The Identity of the Lender</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] The Inception of Title Approach</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] In General</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i] Credit for Down Payment</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] The Distinction Between a Credit Purchase and an Installment Purchase</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Applying Inception of Title Principles to Real Estate Transactions</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d] Reimbursement</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i] In General</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii] Reimbursement in Equitable Distribution States</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] One Rule—Funds Contributed Toward Loan Payments Are Treated as Improvements</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Another View—Loan Payments Can Affect Ownership</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[7] Characterizing Refinancing Transactions</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] In General</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Inception of Title Approach</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Pro Rata Approach</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[8] Loan Payments After Separation but Before Divorce</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[9] Special Equity</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[10] Transmutation</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.06 Trust Principles and Acquisitions Over Time</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] In General</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Resulting Trusts</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Express Trusts</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Constructive Trusts</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.07 Characterizing Property Acquired by Adverse Possession</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.08 Characterizing Life Insurance</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Term Insurance and Whole Life</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Characterizing Life Insurance on the Life of One of the Spouses at Divorce</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] Determining When the Policy Was Acquired</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Characterizing the Policy</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[1] In General 307
[2] Term Insurance 308
[4] Where the Spouse Changes the Beneficiary after the Divorce Action Is Filed and the Insured Spouse Dies 311

[3] Characterizing and Dividing Life Insurance Proceeds Received Pursuant to the Death of a Third Party 311

§ 7.09 Casualty Insurance 312
§ 7.10 Pensions 313

[1] Introduction 313
[2] Types of Pension Plans 314
[a] Defined Contribution Plans 314
[b] Defined Benefit Plans 314
[c] Hybrid Plans 315
[d] Keogh Plans 316
[e] Individual Retirement Accounts 316
[f] Contributory Plans 316
[g] Non-Contributory Plans 316
[h] Qualified Plans 316
[i] Non-Qualified Plans 316

[a] Unvested Rights 316
[b] Vested Rights 317
[c] Matured Rights 318
[d] Rights in Pay Status 318
[e] Accrued Rights 318
[f] Joint and Survivor Option 318

[4] Types of Pension Rights Constituting Divisible Property at Divorce 319

[a] The Basic Pro Rata Deferred Payment Approach 327
[b] Distinction Between Calculating the Marital Share of Defined Contribution Plans and Defined Benefit Plans 336
[c] Issues Under the Pro Rata Deferred Payment Approach 341
[i] Who Pays the Tax 341
[ii] The Start of Payments to the Non-Employee Spouse 342
[iii] Valuing the Months of Employment 345
[iv] Can the Doctrine of Transmutation Apply? 352
[v] The Marital Estate’s Share of Post-Divorce Increases in Pension Benefits, Due to Pension Plan Changes or Cost of Living Adjustments 353
[vi] Devising the Non-Employee Spouse’s Pension Interest 356
[vii] Judicial Limitations on the Retirement Plan Options of the Employee Spouse 358
[viii] Calculating the Coverture Fraction 359
[ix] What Should Be Done About Survivor’s Benefits? 359

[a] Dividing Pensions According to Their Present Value at Divorce 361
[b] Determining the Aggregate Value of the Pension Before Discounting 362
[i] The Working Employee 362
[ii] The Retired Employee 368
[c] Discounting the Aggregate Value of a Pension to Present Value 368
[i] Discounting for Money to Be Received in the Future 369
[ii] Discounting for Unvested Rights 369
[iii] Discounting for Mortality 370
[iv] Discounting for Pre-Marriage and Post-Divorce Employment 370
[v] Discounting for Taxes 372
[vi] Should Post-Retirement COLAs Be Incorporated? 374
[d] Receipt of Benefits by the Non-Employee Spouse 374
[e] The Cut-Off Date and Valuation Date 375


[a] Preemption 380
[b] What Are “Pension Rights”? 381
[i] Disability Retirement 381
[ii] Early Retirement Inducements 385
[iii] Severance Benefits 389
[iv] The Gratuitous Pension 389
[v] Miscellaneous 389
[vi] Subsidized Health Insurance 390
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

[vii] The Distinction Between a Fixed Sum and the Coverture Fraction Method 390

[c] The Effect of a Job Change by the Employee Spouse 390

[d] The Double-Counting Problem 391

[e] The Divisibility of Pensions from State or Local Governments 392

[f] Retroactive Effect of Changes in the Law 393

[g] The Social Security Deduction from Pension Benefits 393

[h] Selecting the Appropriate Valuation Date 395

[i] Survivorship Benefits 397

[j] Tax Issues 399

[k] Waivers of Rights to Pensions in Premarital Agreements 399

[l] Maximum Award to the Non-Employee 400

[m] What Rights Are Earned During Marriage? 400

[n] Amounts Received as a “Retirement Package” 400

[o] Purchasing Additional Credits 400

[p] Changes in Value of Defined Contribution Plan Assets During the Divorce Process 401

[q] Naming the Non-Employee as Beneficiary When the Employee Dies 401

§ 7.11 Employee Stock Options 401

[1] The Nature of Employee Stock Options 401

[2] Employee Stock Options as Property 402

[3] When Employee Stock Options Are Considered Acquired or Earned 404

[a] Options That Are Unexercisable at Divorce 404

[b] Options That Are Exercisable at Divorce 419

[c] Options Exercised During Marriage 421

[i] Options Granted During Marriage 421

[ii] Options Granted Before Marriage That Vested Before Marriage 421

[iii] Options Granted Before Marriage That Vest During Marriage 421

[d] Options Granted after Divorce 422

[e] Options Granted in Flights 423

[f] Tax Concerns 424

[g] Uncharted Waters 424

[h] Options That Are “Under Water” at Divorce 424

[4] Other Types of Restricted Stock 424
§ 7.12 Other Employee Compensation and Fringe Benefits 426
[1] Accrued Vacation, Comp Time or Sick Pay 426
[2] Severance Benefits 433
[3] Bonus 439
[4] Other Benefits 443
[5] Monies Given to Employees Are Not “Gifts” 446
[6] Deferred Compensation 446

§ 7.13 Long-Term Employment Contracts 446

§ 7.14 A Lawyer’s Contingent Fee 448

§ 7.15 Insurance Renewal Commissions and Termination Benefits 451
[1] Renewal Commissions 451
[2] Termination Benefits 452

§ 7.16 Copyrights and Patents

Chapter 8 MISCELLANEOUS PROPERTY INTERESTS 459

§ 8.01 Personal Injury Claims 461
[1] Settlements or Judgments Obtained During Marriage 461
   [a] Kitchen Sink States 461
   [b] Marital Property States 463
      [i] States with Express Statutes 463
      [ii] States without Express Statutes 464
         [A] The Unitary Approach 464
         [B] The Mechanistic Approach 464
         [C] The Analytic Approach 466
         [D] Dividing the Personal Injury Recovery at Divorce 472
   [c] Injuries Before Marriage 472
   [d] Lump-Sum Settlements 473
   [e] Double Recovery of Medical Expenses 474
   [f] Uninsured Motorist Recoveries 474
   [g] No-Fault Insurance Recoveries 475
   [h] Punitive Damages 475
   [i] Loss of Consortium Claims 475
[3] Interspousal Torts 476
   [a] Recoveries During Marriage 479
   [b] Actions Initiated After Divorce 486
      [i] Claims Arising After Divorce 486
      [ii] Claims Arising During Marriage 486
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[5] Criminal Conversation 494
[6] Loss of Consortium 496

§ 8.02 Workers’ Compensation Benefits 496
[1] General Overview 497
[2] Benefits Received During Marriage Regarding an Injury During Marriage 499
[3] Benefits Received After Divorce Regarding an Injury During Marriage 504
   [a] Pending Workers’ Compensation Claim as “Property” Owned at Divorce 504
   [b] When the Benefit Is “Acquired” 504
   [c] Characterization Based Upon What the Benefits Replace 505
   [d] Workers’ Compensation as Insurance Proceeds 506
[4] Benefits Received During Marriage Regarding an Injury Suffered Before Marriage 506
[5] Benefits That Also Replace Retirement Benefits 507

§ 8.03 Disability Benefits 507
[1] Benefits Received During Marriage Regarding a Disability During Marriage 508
[2] Benefits Received After Divorce Regarding a Disability During Marriage 509
   [a] Whether Property Is “Acquired” During Marriage 509
   [b] Characterization Based upon What the Benefits Replace 510
   [c] Characterization Based Upon the Character of the Premiums Paid 515
   [d] Applying the Implied Exclusion Approach 517
   [e] Disability Benefits as Pensions 517
   [f] Case-by-Case Approach 520
   [g] Policy Concerns 520
[3] Benefits Received After Divorce Regarding a Disability After Divorce 521
[4] Benefits Received During Marriage Regarding a Disability Before Marriage 522
[5] Benefits Received After Divorce Regarding a Disability Before Marriage 522

§ 8.04 Wrongful Death Recoveries 522
[1] Implied Exclusion Approach 523

§ 8.05 A Spouse’s Interest in a Trust 525
[1] Corpus of a Trust Created by a Third Party 525
[a] Distributions During Marriage and Appreciation of the Trust Corpus During Marriage 525
   [i] Marital Property States 525
   [ii] Kitchen Sink States 527
[b] Distributions After Divorce 527
   [a] In General 529
   [b] Unusual Circumstances Related to Trying to Reduce Taxes 531
[3] Trust Income 532
   [a] Income Distributed During Marriage 532
      [i] Marital Property States 532
      [ii] Kitchen Sink States 533
   [b] Trust Income Earned During Marriage but Distributed After Divorce 533
[4] Transfer to a Trust by a Spouse During Marriage 534
[5] Revocable Trusts 536
§ 8.06 Remainder Interests 536
   [1] Marital Property States 536
   [3] The Remainder Interest Received Before Marriage That Becomes Possessory During Marriage 537
§ 8.07 Pending Litigation 538
§ 8.08 Other Property Interests 539
   [2] Litigation Recoveries 539
   [3] Prizes or Awards 542
   [4] Lottery Proceeds 543
   [7] Frequent Flyer Miles 544
   [8] Country Club Memberships 545
   [9] September 11 Victims Compensation Awards 545
   [10] Wrongful Conviction Recoveries 545
   [12] 529 Savings Plans 546
   [13] Fishing Quotas 546
   [14] Photo Albums 546
   [15] Carry Over Tax Loss 546
§ 8.09 Dealing with Pets at Divorce 547
   [1] The Traditional Rule: Pets Are Property 547
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Chapter 9  PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION  549

| § 9.01 | States with Express Statutes | 549 |
| § 9.02 | States without Express Statutes | 552 |
| [1] | Whether a Professional Degree and/or License Is Property Owned at Divorce | 552 |
| [a] | The Early Consensus That a Degree or License Is Not Property | 552 |
| [b] | The Acceptance by New York That Degrees and Licenses Are Not Property | 570 |
| [2] | Characterizing an Education as Marital or Separate Property | 570 |
| [3] | Valuation of an Education | 571 |
| [5] | Equitable Remedies | 574 |
| [a] | Alimony | 574 |
| [b] | Rehabilitative Alimony | 577 |
| [c] | Reimbursement Alimony | 577 |
| [d] | Equitable Awards | 580 |
| [6] | Other Remedies | 582 |
| [7] | Student Loans | 583 |
| [8] | Summary | 583 |

### Chapter 10  THE CLOSELY HELD BUSINESS  585

| § 10.01 | The Business Started During Marriage | 586 |
| [1] | The Business as Marital Property | 586 |
| [2] | Rents and Profits | 588 |
| [3] | Increases in Value During Marriage | 588 |
| [a] | In General | 588 |
| [b] | Valuation Techniques | 590 |
| [c] | Various Possible Discounts | 592 |
| [i] | Discount for Taxes | 592 |
| [ii] | Discount of Lack of Marketability and Lack of Control | 593 |
| [d] | Time of Valuation | 595 |
| [5] | Dividing the Business at Divorce | 596 |
| [6] | Valuing the Business and Assuming the Owner Will Not Operate a Competing Business | 596 |
| [7] | Non-Profit Corporations | 596 |
| [8] | Issues Arising When the Business Is Sold Before Divorce | 597 |
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### § 10.02 The Separate Property Business
- [1] The Business as Separate Property 597
- [2] The Distinction Between Retained Earnings and Dividends
  - [a] The Redemption of the Stock of Other Shareholders During Marriage 599
  - [b] The Potential Marital Claim for Unpaid Dividends 599
  - [c] The Liquidating Distribution 604
- [3] Whether Increases in Value During Marriage Are Separate or Marital Property 604
- [4] Allocating the Increase in Value of Separate Property During Marriage
  - [a] The All or Nothing Approach 614
  - [b] The Pereira Approach 615
  - [c] The Van Camp Approach 617
  - [d] Choosing the Appropriate Method 618
  - [e] A Compromise Approach 620
  - [f] Estimating the Percentage of the Appreciation That Resulted from the Spouse’s Efforts 620
- [5] Increases in Value Stemming from Credit 620
- [6] Increases in Value of Other Separate Property Due to the Efforts of a Spouse 621
- [7] The Concept of Alter Ego 622
- [9] Transmuting a Separate Property Business Into a Marital One 622
- [12] Pledging Stock for a Loan 623
- [13] The Distinction Between Salary and Dividends 623

### § 10.03 Goodwill
- [1] Definition and General Calculation 624
- [3] The Professional Practice
  - [a] View I: Professional Goodwill Includes Professional Reputation 635
  - [b] View II: Professional Goodwill as an Indivisible Asset of the Professional Spouse 644
    - [i] The Majority “View II” Approach 644
    - [ii] The Minority “View II” Approach 650
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[c] Professional Goodwill and the Marital Partnership Theory 652
[7] Sale of a Business and Funds Received for a Covenant Not to Compete 658

Chapter 11 TRANSMUTATION—A CHANGE IN THE CHARACTER OF PROPERTY AFTER ACQUISITION 661

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 11.01 Transmutation by Title</th>
<th>662</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1] In General</td>
<td>662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Joint Title</td>
<td>662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Sole Title</td>
<td>673</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 11.02 Transmutation by Agreement; Transmutation by Use</th>
<th>675</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1] Express Agreements (Transmutation by Agreement)</td>
<td>675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Implied Agreements (Transmutation by Use)</td>
<td>678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 11.03 Transmutation of Property by Commingling</th>
<th>681</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1] Disputes Relating to the Character of Funds Remaining in the Account at Divorce</td>
<td>684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] Family Expense Doctrine</td>
<td>684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] “Marital Property Out First” Rule</td>
<td>685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c] Total Recapitulation Concept</td>
<td>687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d] De Minimis Exception</td>
<td>689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e] Contemporaneous Tracing</td>
<td>689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f] Other Approaches</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] The Effect of Transmutation by Commingling</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| § 11.04 Transmutation by Interspousal Gift | 696 |

Chapter 12 DIVISION OF FEDERAL BENEFITS 699

| § 12.01 The Conjunctive and Disjunctive Theories | 700 |
| § 12.02 Types of Benefits | 701 |
| [2] Savings Bonds | 702 |
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[3] Social Security
  [a] Preemption
  [b] Former Spouse's Benefits


[5] Civil Service Retirement


[7] Railroad Retirement

[8] Federal Workers' Compensation Benefits

[9] Private Retirement Benefits

[10] Foreign Service Retirement Benefits

[11] Tribal Land

[12] Involuntary Military Separation Pay


[14] Federal Employees' Compensation Act


[16] Crop Subsidy Payments

§ 12.03 Military Longevity and Disability Retirement

[1] Longevity Retirement
  [a] Generally
  [b] Congressional Action in December 2016
  [c] The Blended Retirement System

[2] Disability Retirement
  [a] Generally
  [b] Disability Determinations before Divorce
  [c] Increased Disability Determinations after Divorce
      (Cases Decided Before 2017)
  [d] The 2017 Howell Decision
  [e] Temporary Disability Benefits

[3] The Survivor Benefit


[6] Accrued Leave


[8] Voluntary Military Severance Pay

[9] Reenlistment Bonus

[10] Military Health Insurance

[11] Disability Benefits Received Before Marriage

Chapter 13 THE DIVORCE ACTION

§ 13.01 Jurisdiction and Choice of Law

[1] Jurisdiction to Order Support Payments
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[2] Jurisdiction to Divide Property 765
   [a] Property Within the State 765
   [b] Property Outside the State 766
[3] Jurisdiction to Grant a Divorce 769
[4] Jurisdiction to Divide Property After Divorce 770
[5] Choice of Law and the Divorce Property Division 772
[6] Foreign Divorce Judgments 776
[7] Conflicting State Judgments 779
[8] Forum Non Conveniens 780

§ 13.02 Division of Property at Divorce 780
[1] Factors Affecting the Property Division 781
   [a] Fault 782
   [b] Relative Incomes and Financial Needs of the Spouses 785
   [c] Contributions of Each Spouse to the Acquisition of the Marital Estate 789
   [d] Dissipating the Marital Estate 790
      [i] Rules That Have Evolved in Community Property States: Types of Transactions 790
         [A] Gifts 790
         [B] Payment of Family Law Obligations Resulting from Prior Relationships 791
         [C] Investments 791
         [D] Gambling and Drug Use 791
            [I] Gambling 791
            [II] Loss of Community Property Due to Drug Use or Other Criminal Activity 792
         [E] Intentional or Reckless Destruction of Property 792
         [F] After the Marriage Has Broken Down 792
            [I] Liquid Assets That Disappear 793
            [II] Management of the Community Estate During the Divorce 793
            [III] The Remedy for Dissipation 793
      [ii] Dissipation Doctrine in Equitable Distribution States 794
         [A] The Period During Which Actions Will Be Considered 794
         [B] What Constitutes Dissipation 796
         [C] Dissipation of Nonmarital Property 797
         [D] Types of Transactions 797
            [I] Intentional Destruction of Marital Property 797
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[II]</td>
<td>Reckless Management of Marital Property</td>
<td>798</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[III]</td>
<td>Selling Marital Property for Much Less Than Fair Market Value</td>
<td>799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[IV]</td>
<td>Consumption Decisions</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[V]</td>
<td>Investments</td>
<td>801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[VI]</td>
<td>Gambling</td>
<td>803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[VII]</td>
<td>Gifts</td>
<td>804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[VIII]</td>
<td>Paying Legal Fees in the Parties’ Divorce</td>
<td>806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[IX]</td>
<td>Initiating Litigation</td>
<td>806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[X]</td>
<td>Losses Resulting from Criminal Acts</td>
<td>806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[XI]</td>
<td>Liquid Assets That Disappear or Substantial Debts That Are Created</td>
<td>807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>While the Marriage Is Breaking Down</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[XII]</td>
<td>Payment of Support Obligations for Other Children or a Previous</td>
<td>808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spouse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[XIII]</td>
<td>Stealing or Hiding Marital Assets</td>
<td>809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E]</td>
<td>The Effect of a Finding of Dissipation</td>
<td>809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e]</td>
<td>Duration of the Marriage</td>
<td>812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f]</td>
<td>The Marital Home</td>
<td>813</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[g]</td>
<td>Benefit to the Marital Estate from a Spouse’s Separate Estate</td>
<td>814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[h]</td>
<td>Miscellaneous Factors</td>
<td>814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Kitchen Sink States</td>
<td>815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[j]</td>
<td>The Parties’ Desires</td>
<td>816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Synthesizing the Factors Affecting Property Division</td>
<td>816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[a] Short Marriages</td>
<td>817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[i] Without Children</td>
<td>817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ii] Marriages Involving Children</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Long Marriages</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Very Large Marital Estates</td>
<td>823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§13.03</td>
<td>Miscellaneous Equitable Distribution Issues</td>
<td>824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Needs That Are Unrelated to the Marriage</td>
<td>824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Independent Claims in the Divorce Action</td>
<td>824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Debts</td>
<td>831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Consideration of Tax Consequences</td>
<td>834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>839</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>844</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>845</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>845</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>845</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>849</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[a]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[b]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>851</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>852</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>853</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>853</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>854</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>855</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 13.04</td>
<td>856</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>857</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>858</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>860</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>862</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>863</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>864</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 865